

Exhibit 12

MARIO N. ALIOTO, ESQ. (56433)
LAUREN C. CAPURRO, ESQ. (241151)
TRUMP, ALIOTO, TRUMP & PRESCOTT, LLP
2280 Union Street
San Francisco, CA 94123
Telephone: (415) 563-7200
Facsimile: (415) 346-0679
E-mail: malioto@tatp.com
lauren russell@tatp.com

PAUL F. NOVAK, ESQ. (*pro hac vice*)
MILBERG LLP
One Kennedy Square
777 Woodward Avenue, Suite 890
Detroit, MI 48226
Telephone: (313) 360-1760
Facsimile: (313) 447-2038
E-mail: pnovak@milberg.com

Counsel for Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

**IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)
ANTITRUST LITIGATION**

Case No. 3:07-cv-5944
MDL No. 1917

CLASS ACTION

This Document Relates to:
All Indirect Purchaser Actions

**DECLARATION OF PAUL F. NOVAK IN
SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' APPLICATION
FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, EXPENSES AND
INCENTIVE AWARDS**

Judge: Honorable Samuel Conti
Courtroom One, 17th Floor

1 I, Paul F. Novak, declare as follows:

2 1. I am an attorney licensed to practice before the courts of Michigan and am admitted
3 pro hac vice before this court. I am a partner in the law firm of Milberg LLP (“Milberg”) and head
4 of the firm’s Antitrust Practice Group. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated in this
5 declaration and, if called as a witness, I could and would testify competently to them. I make this
6 declaration in support of my firm’s request for attorneys’ fees and reimbursement of litigation
7 expenses, as set forth in Plaintiffs’ Application for Attorneys’ Fees, Expenses and Incentive
8 Awards. Milberg also provided Litigation Support e-discovery services which are not addressed in
9 this Declaration but are submitted separately.

10 2. My firm is counsel of record in this case, and represents named plaintiff(s) Ryan
11 Rizzo and Travis Burau. A brief description of Milberg is attached as Exhibit 1 and incorporated
12 herein by reference.

13 3. Throughout the course of this litigation, Milberg kept files contemporaneously
14 documenting all time spent, including tasks performed, and expenses incurred, and transmitted
15 those reports on a regular basis to Lead Counsel. All of the time and expenses reported by Milberg
16 were incurred for the benefit of the Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs (“IPPs”).

17 4. During the course of this litigation, Milberg has been involved in multiple tasks and
18 activities on behalf of the IPPs. All of this work was assigned and/or approved by Lead Counsel
19 and included, but is not limited to, the following:

- 20 • FTAIA (Foreign Trade Antitrust Improvements Act) assignment on opposition
21 brief/motion to dismiss, including legal research of Supremacy and Commerce Clause
22 issues/FTAIA exceptions; state antitrust claims and drafting of brief/motion; memo for oral
23 argument of MTD
- 24 • Address client questionnaires and clients’ retention/supporting documentation issues;
25 clients’ responses to discovery and document requests; class rep issues.
- 26 • Research plaintiffs’ entitlement to jurisdictional discovery regarding subject matter
27 jurisdiction, federal antitrust law preemption of state law claims, foreign relations law, DOJ
28 antitrust guidelines, harmonization statutes
- Ongoing communications and follow up with various states’ Attorney Generals regarding
intervention and settlement

- Prepare for and conduct on site review of Panasonic documents review (Secaucus, NJ); review of Toshiba documents (Paterson, NJ), with attention to pricing and designation of hot documents; conduct analytic review; identify potential deponents
- Address preliminary approval issues related to Chunghwa settlement
- Prepare Statement of Facts in support of motion for class certification; prepare declarations and supporting exhibits to motion for class certification
- Pull and designate documents for certain Hitachi witness depositions. Analysis and summary of hot documents; review documents/propose exhibits of documents for depositions.
- Parens patriae research for discussions/communications with certain state Attorney General offices.
- Prepare Hitachi liability memo.
- Research regarding witnesses and conducting international discovery in Italy and Belgium; foreign discovery coordination.
- Prepare objections and respond to discovery propounded upon IPPs by Hitachi and Panasonic. Conduct legal research into discovery obligations. Respond to discovery propounded upon clients/plaintiffs. Draft and coordinate responses to MTPD, NPPD, and SDI discovery.
- Draft discovery requests addressed to six separate defendants, including Samsung and Panasonic.
- Analysis of Defendants' discovery responses; research regarding potential motions to compel/omnibus motion; draft omnibus motion/brief; investigation into sufficiency of Defendants' responses to discovery requests. Legal research regarding Rule 33(d) and public information. Legal research and draft of motion and reply to motion to compel Toshiba.
- Address status of Defendants' supplemental discovery responses.
- Research summary judgment standards in context of antitrust; draft compendia of state IPP decisions, state consumer protection laws, statute of limitations, antitrust fraudulent concealment and tolling doctrines. Legal research regarding Florida Statute Sec. 95.11; tolling, accrual, and estoppel doctrines. Draft IPP's opposition to summary judgment on the Florida statute of limitations.
- Drafted motion to compel S. Shibata's deposition and to authenticate his documents (Toshiba).
- Reviewed Defendants' deposition designations and prepared objections and counter-designations as assigned by lead counsel.
- Analysis of defendants' trial exhibit list for objections and pass-through issues.
- Draft response to Defendants' motions in limine pertaining to Donnelly Act, NY IPPs' damages claims, and other motions in limine as assigned.

1 5. The schedule attached as Exhibit 2, and incorporated herein, is a detailed summary
2 of the amount of time spent by my firm's partners, attorneys and professional support staff who
3 were involved in this litigation. It does not include any time devoted to preparing this declaration
4 or otherwise pertaining to the Joint Fee Petition. The lodestar calculation is based on my firm's
5 historical billing rates in effect at the time services were performed. Exhibit 2 was prepared from
6 contemporaneous time records regularly prepared and maintained by my firm. Those records have
7 been provided to Lead Counsel and I authorize them to be submitted for inspection by the Court if
8 necessary. The hourly rates for my firm's partners, attorneys and professional support staff
9 included in Exhibit 2 were at the time the work was performed the usual and customary hourly
10 rates charged for their services in similar complex litigation.

11 6. The total number of hours reasonably expended on this litigation by my firm from
12 inception to May 31, 2015 is 5,930.85 hours. The total lodestar for my firm at historical rates is
13 \$2,451,272.00. The total lodestar for my firm at current rates is \$2,617,117.50. Expense items are
14 billed separately and are not duplicated in my firm's lodestar.

15 7. The expenses Milberg incurred in litigating this action are reflected in the books
16 and records of my firm. These books and records are prepared from expense vouchers, invoices,
17 receipts, check records and other source materials and accurately reflect the expenses incurred.
18 Milberg's expense records are available for inspection by the Court if necessary.

19 8. My firm incurred a total of \$81,977.64 in unreimbursed expenses, all of which were
20 reasonable and necessary for the prosecution of this litigation. Of this amount, \$60,000.00 was for
21 assessment payments for common litigation expenses or direct payments to experts or other
22 vendors made at the request of Lead Counsel, and an additional \$21,977.64 was for non-common
23 litigation expenses incurred by my firm, such as travel, meals and lodging, copying, legal research,
24 telephone, etc. A summary of those expenses by category is attached as Exhibit 3.

25 9. Milberg LLP has a referral fee agreement with Ademi & O'Reilly LLP. Payment
26 of referral fees, if any, made by Milberg LLP under this fee agreement would be from Milberg
27 LLP's fee and would not increase the overall fees requested by Plaintiffs' Counsel and would not
28

1 reduce the amount recovered by the Class. The details of the fee agreement can be provided to the
2 Court at the Court's request.

3
4 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 27th
5 day of July, 2015, at Detroit, Michigan.

6 /s/ Paul F. Novak
7 Paul F. Novak
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT 1



NEW YORK
LOS ANGELES
DETROIT

THE FIRM'S PRACTICE AND ACHIEVEMENTS

Milberg LLP, founded in 1965, was one of the first law firms to prosecute class actions in federal courts on behalf of investors and consumers. The Firm pioneered this type of litigation and is widely recognized as a leader in defending the rights of victims of corporate and other large-scale wrongdoing. The Firm's practice focuses on the prosecution of class and complex actions in many fields, including securities, corporate fiduciary, ERISA, consumer, False Claims Act, antitrust, bankruptcy, mass tort, and human rights litigation. The Firm has offices in New York City, Los Angeles, and Detroit.

In its early years, the Firm built a new area of legal practice in representing shareholder interests under the then recently amended Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, which allowed securities fraud cases, among others, to proceed as class actions. In the following decades, the Firm obtained decisions establishing important legal precedents in many of its areas of practice and prosecuted cases that set benchmarks in terms of case theories, organization, discovery, trial results, methods of settlement, and amounts recovered and distributed to clients and class members.

Important milestones in the Firm's early years include the Firm's involvement in the *U.S. Financial* litigation in the early 1970s, one of the earliest large class actions, which resulted in a \$50 million recovery for purchasers of the securities of a failed real estate development company; the Ninth Circuit decision in *Blackie v. Barrack* in 1975, which established the fraud-on-the-market doctrine for securities fraud actions; the Firm's co-lead counsel position in the *In re Washington Public Power Supply System Securities Litigation*, a seminal securities fraud action in the 1980s in terms of complexity and amounts recovered; the representation of the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation in a year-long trial to recover banking losses from a major accounting firm, leading to a precedent-setting global settlement; attacking the Drexel-Milken "daisy chain" of illicit junk-bond financing arrangements with numerous cases that resulted in substantial recoveries for investors; representing life insurance policyholders defrauded by "vanishing premium" and other improper sales tactics and obtaining large recoveries from industry participants; and ground-breaking roles in the multi-front attack on deception and other improper activities in the tobacco industry.

Milberg remains at the forefront in its areas of practice. Significant litigation results include: *In re Vivendi Universal, S.A. Securities Litigation* (post-verdict proceedings pending with claims valued at over \$1 billion); *In re Tyco International, Ltd. Securities Litigation* (\$3.2 billion settlement); *In re Nortel Networks Corp. Securities Litigation* (settlement for cash and stock valued at \$1.142 billion); *In re Lucent Technologies, Inc. Securities Litigation* (\$600 million recovery); *In re Raytheon Co. Securities Litigation* (\$460 million recovery); *In re Managed Care Litigation* (recoveries over \$1 billion and major changes in HMO practices); the *In re Washington Public Power Supply System Securities Litigation* (settlements totaling \$775 million), and the *In re NASDAQ Market-Makers Antitrust Litigation* (\$1 billion in recoveries). Milberg has been responsible for recoveries valued at approximately \$55 billion during the life of the Firm.

The Firm's lawyers come from many different professional backgrounds. They include prosecutors, private defense attorneys, and government lawyers. The Firm's ability to pursue claims against defendants is augmented by its team of investigators, headed by a 27-year veteran of the Federal Bureau of Investigation, as well as in-house staff with expertise in forensic accounting and financial analysis. In addition, Milberg offers in-house e-discovery specialists and data hosting capabilities. The Firm is regularly recognized as one of the nation's leading plaintiffs' law firms by the *National Law Journal*, *Legal 500*, *Chambers USA*, and *Super Lawyers*, among others.

For more information, please visit www.milberg.com.

EXHIBIT 2

TIME AND LODESTAR SUMMARY
INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	2009		

Name/Status	Hourly Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
Novak, Paul F. (P)	\$700	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.75	0.0	5.75	26.75	0.0	0.0	34.25	\$23,975.00
Wedgworth, Peggy (P)	\$480	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
McKenna, Elizabeth (SC)	\$460	1.25	0.0	0.0	4.75	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	77.50	202.3	0.0	0.0	285.75	\$131,445.00
Bobkin, Adam (A)	\$280	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bongiorno, Angela (A)	\$280	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Foglietta, Scott (A)	\$280	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Gjonaj, Diana (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Hughes, John (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Minuci, Matthew (A)	\$400	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Muzingo, Joseph (A)	\$430	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Stamatopoulos, Gregory (A)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Tarnor, Nathan (A)	\$500	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bricker, Halene (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Chaffins, Cecille (PL)	\$285	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Choi, Kyung-Rok (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.00	\$1,890.00
Figueroa, Alyssa (PL)	\$225	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Kramer, Leslie (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Loomis, Hailey (PL)	\$255	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Maher, Meghan (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	12.25	22.00	0.0	0.0	34.25	\$9,247.50
Brown, James M. (FA)	\$425	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Totals		2.25	0.0	0.0	4.75	0.0	0.0	0.75	0.0	102.50	251.00	0.0	0.0	361.25	\$166,557.50

STATUS:

(P) Partner
(SC) Senior Counsel
(A) Associate
(LC) Law Clerk
(PL) Paralegal
(I) Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy
2 Court Appearance
3 Client Meeting
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses
5 Deposition Preparation
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend
7 Document Review
8 Experts - Work or Consult
9 Research
10 Motions/Pleadings
11 Settlement
12 Trial

TIME AND LODestar SUMMARY
INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	2010		

Name/Status	Hourly Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
Novak, Paul F. (P)	\$700	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.50	0.0	0.0	11.00	0.0	0.0	4.00	4.25	0.0	19.75	\$13,825.00
Wedgworth, Peggy (P)	\$480	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
McKenna, Elizabeth (SC)	\$460	0.0	0.0	0.50	3.50	0.0	0.0	4.00	0.0	0.0	14.70	0.0	0.0	22.70	\$10,442.00
Bobkin, Adam (A)	\$280	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bongiorno, Angela (A)	\$280	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Foglietta, Scott (A)	\$280	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.8	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.8	\$210.00
Gjonaj, Diana (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Hughes, John (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Minuci, Matthew (A)	\$400	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Muzingo, Joseph (A)	\$430	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.00	0.0	0.0	26.50	0.0	15.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	45.50	\$19,565.00
Stamatopoulos, Gregory (A)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Tarnor, Nathan (A)	\$500	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bricker, Halene (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Chaffins, Cecille (PL)	\$285	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Choi, Kyung-Rok (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.75	0.0	0.0	2.75	\$742.50
Figueroa, Alyssa (PL)	\$225	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Kramer, Leslie (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Loomis, Hailey (PL)	\$255	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.00	0.0	0.0	2.00	\$510.00
Maher, Meghan (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Brown, James M. (FA)	\$425	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Totals		0.0	0.0	0.50	8.00	0.0	0.0	42.25	0.0	15.00	23.45	4.25	0.0	93.45	\$45,294.50

STATUS:

(P)	Partner
(SC)	Senior Counsel
(A)	Associate
(LC)	Law Clerk
(PL)	Paralegal
(I)	Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy	7 Document Review
2 Court Appearance	8 Experts - Work or Consult
3 Client Meeting	9 Research
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses	10 Motions/Pleadings
5 Deposition Preparation	11 Settlement
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend	12 Trial

TIME AND LODestar SUMMARY
INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	2011		

Name/Status	Hourly Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
Novak, Paul F. (P)	\$775	0.50	1.50	0.25	0.0	0.0	0.0	3.50	0.0	1.75	1.75	25.75	0.0	35.00	\$27,125.00
Wedgworth, Peggy (P)	\$550	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
McKenna, Elizabeth (SC)	\$525	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.75	0.0	0.0	80.00	0.0	0.0	8.75	0.50	0.0	92.00	\$48,300.00
Bobkin, Adam (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	20.50	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	20.50	\$7,175.00
Bongiorno, Angela (A)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	115.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	115.00	\$37,375.00
Foglietta, Scott (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.20	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.20	\$18,970.00
Gjonaj, Diana (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Hughes, John (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Minuci, Matthew (A)	\$400	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	40.50	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	40.50	\$16,200.00
Muzingo, Joseph (A)	\$475	26.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	309.00	0.0	12.50	13.50	0.50	0.0	361.50	\$171,712.50
Stamatopoulos, Gregory (A)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Tarnor, Nathan (A)	\$500	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bricker, Halene (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Chaffins, Cecille (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Choi, Kyung-Rok (PL)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	1.25	0.0	0.0	2.25	\$675.00
Figueroa, Alyssa (PL)	\$225	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	3.75	10.00	0.0	13.75	\$3,093.75
Kramer, Leslie (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Loomis, Hailey (PL)	\$255	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Maher, Meghan (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Brown, James M. (FA)	\$475	1.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	16.5	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	17.50	\$8,312.50
Totals		27.50	1.50	0.25	2.75	0.0	0.0	640.20	0.0	14.25	29.00	36.75	0.0	752.20	\$338,938.75

STATUS:

(P)	Partner
(SC)	Senior Counsel
(A)	Associate
(LC)	Law Clerk
(PL)	Paralegal
(I)	Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy	7 Document Review
2 Court Appearance	8 Experts - Work or Consult
3 Client Meeting	9 Research
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses	10 Motions/Pleadings
5 Deposition Preparation	11 Settlement
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend	12 Trial

TIME AND LODESTAR SUMMARY
INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	2012		

Name/Status	Hourly Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
Novak, Paul F. (P)	\$775	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.50	0.0	0.50	0.0	0.0	0.75	0.0	0.0	1.75	\$1,356.25
Wedgworth, Peggy (P)	\$550	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
McKenna, Elizabeth (SC)	\$525	0.50	0.0	0.25	0.25	0.0	0.0	77.25	0.0	0.0	9.75	0.0	0.0	88.00	\$46,200.00
Bobkin, Adam (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bongiorno, Angela (A)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	903.50	0.0	0.0	2.00	0.0	0.0	905.50	\$294,287.50
Foglietta, Scott (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Gjonaj, Diana (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	60.50	0.0	0.0	60.50	\$21,175.00
Hughes, John (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Minuci, Matthew (A)	\$400	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Muzingo, Joseph (A)	\$475	16.00	0.0	6.50	0.0	0.0	0.0	93.00	0.0	0.0	8.50	0.0	0.0	124.00	\$58,900.00
Stamatopoulos, Gregory (A)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	742.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	742.00	\$222,600.00
Tarnor, Nathan (A)	\$500	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bricker, Halene (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Chaffins, Cecille (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Choi, Kyung-Rok (PL)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.50	0.0	0.0	4.50	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.00	\$1,500.00
Figueroa, Alyssa (PL)	\$225	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Kramer, Leslie (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	16.50	0.0	0.0	16.50	\$5,362.50
Loomis, Hailey (PL)	\$255	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Maher, Meghan (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Brown, James M. (FA)	\$475	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	10.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	10.00	\$4,750.00
Totals		16.50	0.0	6.75	0.75	0.50	0.0	1,830.75	0.0	0.0	98.00	0.0	0.0	1,953.25	\$656,131.25

STATUS:

(P)	Partner
(SC)	Senior Counsel
(A)	Associate
(LC)	Law Clerk
(PL)	Paralegal
(I)	Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy	7 Document Review
2 Court Appearance	8 Experts - Work or Consult
3 Client Meeting	9 Research
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses	10 Motions/Pleadings
5 Deposition Preparation	11 Settlement
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend	12 Trial

TIME AND LODESTAR SUMMARY

INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	2013		

Name/Status	Hourly Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
Novak, Paul F. (P)	\$775	2.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.00	0.0	0.0	6.75	31.70	0.0	41.45	\$32,123.75
Wedgworth, Peggy (P)	\$550	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
McKenna, Elizabeth (SC)	\$525	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.45	0.0	0.0	0.25	0.0	0.0	2.70	\$1,417.50
Bobkin, Adam (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bongiorno, Angela (A)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	203.00	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	203.00	\$65,975.00
Foglietta, Scott (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Gjonaj, Diana (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Hughes, John (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Minuci, Matthew (A)	\$400	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Muzingo, Joseph (A)	\$475	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Stamatopoulos, Gregory (A)	\$328	4.75	0.0	0.0	0.0	302.00	0.0	507.00	0.0	0.0	10.00	0.0	0.0	823.75	\$270,087.50
Tarnor, Nathan (A)	\$500	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bricker, Halene (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.25	0.0	0.0	0.25	\$81.25
Chaffins, Cecille (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Choi, Kyung-Rok (PL)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Figueroa, Alyssa (PL)	\$225	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Kramer, Leslie (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Loomis, Hailey (PL)	\$255	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Maher, Meghan (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Brown, James M. (FA)	\$475	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Totals		6.75	0.0	0.0	0.0	302.00	0.0	713.45	0.0	0.0	17.25	31.70	0.0	1,071.15	\$369,685.00

STATUS:

(P)	Partner
(SC)	Senior Counsel
(A)	Associate
(LC)	Law Clerk
(PL)	Paralegal
(I)	Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy	7 Document Review
2 Court Appearance	8 Experts - Work or Consult
3 Client Meeting	9 Research
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses	10 Motions/Pleadings
5 Deposition Preparation	11 Settlement
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend	12 Trial

TIME AND LODESTAR SUMMARY
INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	2014		

Name/Status	Hourly Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
Novak, Paul F. (P)	\$791	0.50	0.0	0.0	59.80	0.75	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	29.25	7.00	0.0	97.30	\$76,921.25
Wedgworth, Peggy (P)	\$700	0.0	0.0	0.0	176.75	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	52.00	0.0	0.0	228.75	\$160,062.50
McKenna, Elizabeth (SC)	\$573	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.00	0.0	0.0	1.50	0.0	0.0	0.25	0.0	0.0	2.75	\$1,575.00
Bobkin, Adam (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	40.50	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	3.00	40.00	0.0	0.0	83.50	\$31,312.50
Bongiorno, Angela (A)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.00	6.75	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	11.75	\$3,818.75
Foglietta, Scott (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Gjonaj, Diana (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.50	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.50	\$1,575.00
Hughes, John (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	16.50	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	29.00	10.00	0.0	0.0	55.50	\$20,812.50
Minuci, Matthew (A)	\$400	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Muzingo, Joseph (A)	\$475	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Stamatopoulos, Gregory (A)	\$350	0.50	0.0	0.0	122.75	0.0	0.0	55.75	0.0	32.50	117.25	0.0	0.0	328.75	\$115,062.50
Tarnor, Nathan (A)	\$500	2.00	0.0	0.0	315.25	8.00	0.0	0.0	1.00	62.50	108.75	0.0	0.0	497.50	\$248,750.00
Bricker, Halene (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	21.25	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.75	7.50	0.0	0.0	31.50	\$10,237.50
Chaffins, Cecille (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.00	0.0	0.0	4.00	\$1,300.00
Choi, Kyung-Rok (PL)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Figueroa, Alyssa (PL)	\$225	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Kramer, Leslie (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Loomis, Hailey (PL)	\$255	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Maher, Meghan (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Brown, James M. (FA)	\$475	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Totals		3.00	0.0	0.0	763.30	15.50	0.0	57.25	1.00	129.75	369.00	7.00	0.0	1,345.80	\$671,427.50

STATUS:

(P)	Partner
(SC)	Senior Counsel
(A)	Associate
(LC)	Law Clerk
(PL)	Paralegal
(I)	Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy	7 Document Review
2 Court Appearance	8 Experts - Work or Consult
3 Client Meeting	9 Research
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses	10 Motions/Pleadings
5 Deposition Preparation	11 Settlement
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend	12 Trial

TIME AND LODestar SUMMARY
INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	2015		

Name/Status	Hourly Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
Novak, Paul F. (P)	\$800	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.25	5.75	39.00	45.00	\$36,000.00
Wedgworth, Peggy (P)	\$750	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.50	0.0	105.75	113.25	\$84,937.50
McKenna, Elizabeth (SC)	\$600	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	50.25	50.25	\$30,150.00
Bobkin, Adam (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Bongiorno, Angela (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Foglietta, Scott (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Gjonaj, Diana (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	3.50	0.0	0.0	81.00	84.50	\$29,575.00
Hughes, John (A)	\$375	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.00	7.00	\$2,625.00
Minuci, Matthew (A)	\$400	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Muzingo, Joseph (A)	\$475	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Stamatopoulos, Gregory (A)	\$350	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.00	0.0	0.0	29.50	34.50	\$12,075.00
Tarnor, Nathan (A)	\$500	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	9.25	9.25	\$4,625.00
Bricker, Halene (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.75	9.25	10.00	\$3,250.00
Chaffins, Cecille (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Choi, Kyung-Rok (PL)	\$300	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Figueroa, Alyssa (PL)	\$225	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Kramer, Leslie (PL)	\$325	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Loomis, Hailey (PL)	\$255	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Maher, Meghan (PL)	\$270	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Brown, James M. (FA)	\$475	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
Totals		0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	8.50	7.75	6.50	331.00	353.75	\$203,237.50

STATUS:

(P) Partner
(SC) Senior Counsel
(A) Associate
(LC) Law Clerk
(PL) Paralegal
(I) Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy
2 Court Appearance
3 Client Meeting
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses
5 Deposition Preparation
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend
7 Document Review
8 Experts - Work or Consult
9 Research
10 Motions/Pleadings
11 Settlement
12 Trial

TIME AND LODESTAR SUMMARY

INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP		
Reporting Year	Inception through May 31, 2015		

Year		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	Hours	Historical Fees
2007		0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
2008		0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	\$0.00
2009		2.25	0.0	0.0	4.75	0.0	0.0	0.75	0.0	102.50	251.00	0.0	0.0	361.25	\$166,557.50
2010		0.0	0.0	0.50	8.00	0.0	0.0	42.25	0.0	15.00	23.45	4.25	0.0	93.45	\$45,294.50
2011		27.50	1.50	0.25	2.75	0.0	0.0	640.20	0.0	14.25	29.00	36.75	0.0	752.20	\$338,938.75
2012		16.50	0.0	6.75	0.75	0.50	0.0	1,830.75	0.0	0.0	98.00	0.0	0.0	1,953.25	\$656,131.25
2013		6.75	0.0	0.0	0.0	302.00	0.0	713.45	0.0	0.0	17.25	31.70	0.0	1,071.15	\$369,685.00
2014		3.00	0.0	0.0	763.30	15.50	0.0	57.25	1.0	129.75	369.00	7.00	0.0	1,345.80	\$671,427.50
2015		0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	8.50	7.75	6.50	331.00	353.75	\$203,237.50
		56.00	1.50	7.50	779.55	318.00	-	3,284.65	1.00	270.00	795.45	86.20	331.00	5,930.85	\$2,451,272.00

STATUS:

(P) Partner
(SC) Senior Counsel
(A) Associate
(LC) Law Clerk
(PL) Paralegal
(I) Investigator

CATEGORIES:

1 Attorney Meeting/Strategy
2 Court Appearance
3 Client Meeting
4 Draft Discovery Requests or Responses
5 Deposition Preparation
6 Attend Deposition - Conduct/Defend
7 Document Review
8 Experts - Work or Consult
9 Research
10 Motions/Pleadings
11 Settlement
12 Trial

EXHIBIT 3

EXPENSE SUMMARY
INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS

Firm Name	Milberg LLP
Reporting Year	Inception through May 31, 2015

TYPE OF EXPENSE		TOTAL
Assessments		\$60,000.00
Outside Copies		0.00
In-house Reproduction /Copies		1,084.30
Court Costs & Filing Fees		1,721.50
Court Reporters 7 Transcripts		0.00
Computer Research		15,732.02
Telephone & Facsimile		0.00
Postage/Express Delivery/Courier		0.00
Professional Fees (investigator, accountant, etc.)		0.00
Experts		0.00
Witness / Service Fees		0.00
Travel: Airfare		1,444.15
Travel: Lodging/Meals		1,088.22
Travel: Other		0.00
Car Rental/Cabfare/Parking		907.45
Other Expenses		0.00
Totals		\$81,977.64